BOOK REVIEW


Generally, the Colonial period in the American Southwest is considered to begin when Francisco Vázquez de Coronado’s Entrada entered what is now New Mexico and encountered the Zuni people at the village of Hawikku in the spring of 1540. Thus began a 280 year period of intense and sustained colonial interactions, the reverberations of which are still experienced by traditional descendant communities today. At Zuni, for example, the community continues to debate the future of the old Zuni mission that exists in the Middle Village. The mission was built by the Spanish in 1629 and named “Our Lady of Guadalupe Church.” Some Zunis advocate for the preservation of the mission as a significant historical structure that plays an important role in Zuni history, community and identity, and as a source of economic benefit for the community through tourism. Others opine that the mission is a symbol of oppression and a reminder of a terrible period in Zuni history that needs to be forgotten, not memorialized.

*New Mexico and the Pimeria Alta: The Colonial Period in the American Southwest* cogently examines this interesting, complex, and emotional historical period. The focus is on two major areas of the American Southwest: the New Mexico Colony (from northeastern Arizona to central New Mexico) and the Pimeria Alta in the northern Sonoran Desert. In addressing an historical understanding of the effects of colonialism, the book contends that the traditional viewpoint has focused on its unidirectional effect on indigenous populations and therefore is too simplistic. Colonialism is now viewed by many scholars as highly complex in the nature of social relations that existed among multiple agents. The editors (Douglas and Graves) contend that an important goal in understanding colonialism is not to view it as an event or a defining moment in history, but rather to see it as a context or process in which one can view “cultural entanglements” (p.7). This book achieves that goal.

The book is divided into three parts and is organized around geographic regions with chapters ordered roughly chronologically. Part I of the volume focuses on the New Mexico Colony. The chapters comprising this part address issues of factionalism and alliances; perspectives on landscapes and mobility; social memory; the strategy of abandonment; production and consumption; indigenous and Spanish imperialism; warfare and military strategies; and ethnogenesis, identity, and demography. Part II details colonial encounters in the Pimeria Alta including Native American population dynamics in the region, military settlements and colonial strategies, ranching economies and influences, and indigenous agricultural responses to colonialism. Part III contains two chapters that provide discussion and commentary on the preceding chapters.

The book begins (Chapter 1) with an introduction to Parts I-III by editors Douglas and Graves, who also provide an exceptional introduction to the Colonial Period in the American Southwest and the latest theoretical advances in the archaeology of colonialism.

Part I is made up of eight chapters. In chapter 2, utilizing historic accounts and excavated archaeological material, Matthew Schmader explores the contexts of the Francisco Vázquez de Coronado 1540–1542 expedition and the subsequent battle with the Tiwa village of Piedras Marcadas Pueblo. In chapter 3, Leckman explores the interplay between Puebloan and Spanish concepts of landscape and their impacts on the early New Mexico colony through
a consideration of spatial organization and land use practices. Utilizing archaeological data from Awat’ovi and Walpi in chapter 4, Webster explores the development of Hopi weaving during the Spanish colonial period and how it was reinterpreted and transformed. In chapter 5, Liebman and colleagues, utilizing archaeological evidence, document and discuss the complexities of enduring alliances among northern Rio Grande Pueblo communities during the post Pueblo Revolt period. Chapter 6 examines the Comanche presence in New Mexico during the Spanish colonial era.

Chapters 7 and 8 examine the integrative processes and social transformations of late colonial New Mexico. In chapter 7, utilizing archaeological and ethnohistoric materials, Darling and Eiselt describe the emergence of the Vecino. Continuing this theme, Jenks, in chapter 8, identifies and interprets evidence of Vecino identity from excavated Hispanic New Mexican sites from the Spanish colonial period. Utilizing Spanish historical records and Hopi oral traditions, Sheridan and Koyiyumptewa in chapter 9 document “intergenerational memory of colonial trauma” among contemporary Hopis which is an enduring effect of Spanish oppression of the Hopi during the Colonial period. Sheridan and Koyiyumptewa’s research presented in this chapter was particularly poignant for me having personally witnessed intergenerational memory of historical trauma among contemporary Zuni religious leaders. As an aside, it would be well for federal agencies to appreciate and understand the poignancy of intergenerational memory of trauma and its influence as a backdrop within the context of federal/tribal consultation.

Part II is comprised of four chapters that focus on the Pimeria Alta by concentrating on colonial encounters that include regional indigenous population dynamics, military settlements and colonial strategies, ranching economies and influences, and Native American agricultural responses to colonialism. Chapter 10 (Jelinek and Brenneman) focuses on the Native American demographic landscape during the early colonial period to inform on native population diversity and interaction. Pavao-Zuckerman, in chapter 11, discusses the deleterious effects of the introduction of livestock into the area, combined with missionization and other colonial structures, on the sustainability of traditional native subsistence strategies. Thiel (chapter 12) examines everyday life and experiences of soldiers and settlers at the Tucson presidio and how these occupants transformed their social identities from those associated with caste and race to ones that promoted community integration. The final chapter (13) explores the response of the O’odham to colonialism by intensifying irrigation agriculture to meet the demands of Spanish missions and later economic markets which led to positive economic outcomes. Here, Strawhacker suggests that these economic changes also led to changes in O’odham social structure and the resultant centralization of leadership.

Part III contains two discussant chapters. In chapter 14, Lightfoot compares the colonial experience in the American Southwest to those in Alta California. Lightfoot’s stated goal is to compare the contents of the book with developments taking place in the archaeology of colonialism in Alta California (p. 356). Lightfoot identifies and discusses four themes: early colonial encounters, research on colonial settlements, colonialism in indigenous landscapes, and legacies of colonialism. In chapter 15, David Hurst Thomas compares the colonial experience in La Florida (American Southeast) to the one experienced in the American Southwest through the development of related themes about the importance of materiality and agency as it played out in the “practical politics” (p. 379) of both colonial encounters. Of particular interest was Thomas’ critique of the Theory of Superposition which argues that whenever a pre-revolt kiva is associated with a church and convent in colonial New Mexico, it has been assumed by scholars that the Franciscans deliberately built their church over that earlier sacred space to obliterate the pagan past. Thomas argues that aside from the one definitive example from Awatovi, there are no other examples of kivas being deliberately buried
beneath Catholic churches in New Mexico and the colonial Southwest (p. 393). He argues that the rejection of the Grand Narrative in our understanding of the colonial period in the Southwest no longer requires that either Pueblos or Franciscans have a passive voice; rather, a rereading of historical Spanish documents suggests a more dynamic encounter between equivalent and dynamic agents.

The editors and contributing authors are to be congratulated for providing multiple and uniquely different perspectives on the Colonial Period. Each chapter is well written and enjoyable to read. This volume is an important contribution in advancing our understanding of the archaeology of colonialism. Scholars and students of the Colonial Period will find this volume an important and pleasant addition to their libraries.

Kurt Dongoske
Zuni Cultural Resource Enterprise, Pueblo of Zuni, New Mexico, USA
kdongoske@cableone.net

© 2020 Kurt Dongoske
https://doi.org/10.1080/19442890.2020.1723220